



From the Rabbi's Desk: (Leil) Shabbos Breakfast

Question:

Dear Rabbi Sprung,

This year *Asara b'Teves* falls on a Friday. Is it Halachically acceptable to break my fast with a light meal of cake and coffee rather than a full *Seudas Shabbos*?

Answer:

The fast of *Asara b'Teves* will end at nightfall on Friday night (see *Shulchan Aruch* and *Rema O.C. 249:4*). Since the fast ends after Shabbos has begun, one must recite Kiddush before eating or drinking.

People are usually capable of waiting to eat until they return from Shul, especially in the case of *Asara b'Teves* when Shabbos begins fairly early. However, you find it difficult to break your fast on the Shabbos *Seuda* and would prefer to break the fast with a light meal and eat the *Seuda* later.

It is generally accepted to follow the ruling of the *Zohar* not to eat dairy and meat in the same meal, even if one rinses his mouth after eating dairy (as stated by the Poskim – see *Y.D. 89*). If so, he cannot make Kiddush, wash *Netilas Yadayim*, eat bread, and then drink coffee (with milk) since he will not be permitted to continue his fleishig Shabbos meal.

One possibility is to make Kiddush and drink a cup of coffee quickly before beginning the *Seuda*. However, if you want to relax and take your time over your coffee and cake it seems that your only option is to make Kiddush, have coffee and cake, recite a *Bracha Acharona*, and then wait [approximately] an hour before starting your Shabbos meal. This would be the preferable course of action for one who finds it difficult to break his fast with the *Seudas Shabbos*.

An analogous situation often arises on *Leil Simchas Torah* when many communities have Kiddush and cake before beginning *Hakafos*. On Shabbos morning most people are lenient and consider their Kiddush with *Mezonos* as *Kiddush b'Makom Seuda* (though some are stringent). Does the same apply to Kiddush on Friday night or the night of Yom Tov?

The *Shulchan Aruch* rules (273:5):

The Gaonim wrote regarding Kiddush b'Makom Seuda: even if a person eats something minimal or drinks a cup of wine that requires a Bracha, he fulfills the

obligation of *Kiddush b'Makom Seuda* and may complete his meal elsewhere. **But only if he eats bread or drinks wine; if he eats fruit this does not [suffice].**

The *Mishna Berura* elaborates (*ibid.* 25-26):

Or drinks wine – a person is certainly Yotzei if he eats pastries [made from] the five species [of grain], for they are more significant in a Shabbos Seuda than wine. But one is not Yotzei b'Makom Seuda with beer and other beverages, even if they are Chamar Medina, since they do not satisfy the heart like wine. See Chiddushei R' Akiva Eiger and the Tosefes Shabbos¹ who prove that, according to several Rishonim, one is not Yotzei Kiddush b'Makom Seuda with a cup of wine. Hence, it seems that one should only be lenient in a Sha'as haD'chak.

Not fruits – the five species [of grain] are called Mazon and wine satisfies the heart, but other things are not considered a Seuda at all even if he eats a large amount. Therefore, one should not eat anything during the customary visits to a Chasan's home or a Bris Mila where they only serve delicacies after Kiddush [without Mezonos]...

It is clear from the *Mishna Berura* that Mezonos baked goods are considered *Kiddush b'Makom Seuda* even if they are not bread products. However, the *Biur Halacha* cautions: "The *Sefer Ma'ase Rav* states that even for the *Kiddush* of Shabbos day the *Gra* would only make *Kiddush* with a real *Seuda*; not on pastries or wine." In line with this practice of the *Gra* (*Ma'ase Rav, Hilchos Shabbos* 122), the *Machmirim* only eat bread after *Kiddush*, even in the morning when *Kiddush* is *mid'Rabbanan*. Presumably, they would certainly be stringent for the night *Kiddush*.

The *Mishna Berura* cites a *Machlokes* if a single *Revi'is* of wine is sufficient to be considered *Kiddush b'Makom Seuda* or if an additional *Revi'is* is necessary to meet this requirement. As mentioned above, *R' Akiva Eiger* and the *Tosefes Shabbos* do not permit fulfilling *Kiddush b'Makom Seuda* with wine at all, and the *Mishna Berura* concludes that it should only be used in a *Sha'as haD'chak*. The *Mishna Berura* does not make similar comments about *Mezonos*.²

The *Biur Halacha* (249:2) cites the *Or Zarua's* opinion that it is a *Mitzvah* to eat the *Seudas Shabbos* with an appetite. Therefore, since bread constitutes the primary part of a meal, a person may not eat "chremzel" on Shabbos morning before his *Seuda* as he will not have an appetite for bread. He mentions that the *Darchei Moshe* disagrees with this ruling and that the *Magen Avraham* agrees with it. He continues:

In our areas where we do not wash Netilas Yadayim before Kiddush, the Minhag is to be lenient in the morning following the Darchei Moshe and to eat Mezonos after Kiddush before the meal. See the Shulchan Aruch haRav who upholds the Minhag and rules that one should not protest those who are lenient.

¹ R' Refoel Meisels zt"l (c. 1696-1777), *Av Beis Din* of Parychy, Belarus.

² The *Shemiras Shabbos Kehilchasa* also rules like the *Mishna Berura* (54:22-23).

Nevertheless, some pious men are stringent when possible following the Magen Avraham. Thus, immediately after Kiddush they wash their hands, make a Bracha over bread, and eat everything within the meal. The Sefer Shulchan Atzei Shittim states likewise. At any rate, everyone agrees that it is correct not to fill one's stomach with other foods before the bread meal.

This implies that the only concern about eating *Mezonos* after Kiddush is that it will ruin the appetite for the *Seuda*, not that it does not fulfill *Kiddush b'Makom Seuda*. However, a person should take care not to eat too much.

R' Yehuda Aryeh Dunner rules likewise in the name of R' Chaim Kanievsky *zt"l*, asserting that, if necessary, a person may make Kiddush on cake and afterward eat his bread meal.

The *Shulchan Shlomo* (273, p245 in the footnote) states:

*Regarding whether a person who made Kiddush and ate Mezonos must repeat Kiddush before the Seuda, Maran *zt"l* replied that we are not concerned for the opinion of the Gra, cited by the Biur Halacha (s.v. "Kasvu haGeonim"), who would only make Kiddush in the day in a real Makom Seuda but not on pastries. Hence, one need not make Kiddush again before the Seuda. However, in his later years, Maran replied to a different person that although we do not follow the view that Kiddush b'Makom Seuda can only be fulfilled with bread, it is nevertheless fitting that a person who makes Kiddush and eats Mezonos should repeat Kiddush before the Seuda. This is because the primary enactment was to have a meal over wine. He added that, in such a case, a person need not recite the Pesukim that people usually say before Kiddusha Rabba. He is also not required to make the Kiddush before the Seuda; rather, immediately upon beginning the meal he may recite Borei Pri haGafen so that the primary Kevius of the Seuda will be over wine. He added that this is his Minhag.*

In conclusion, the *Mishna Berura* seems to permit a person to make Kiddush on wine, have coffee and cake, make a *Bracha Acharona*, wash his hands, and eat his *Seuda*, provided he does not eat so much that he will ruin his appetite. However, the *Gra* is stringent, and some follow his opinion, including R' Shlomo Zalman Auerbach in his later years.

Therefore, a person may be lenient and follow the basic Halacha, though it is praiseworthy to be stringent (in which case he may follow Rav Shlomo Zalman's advice, above).